The Australian Journal of
INDIGENOUS EDUCATION

This article was originally published in printed form. The journal began in 1973 and was titled *The Aboriginal Child at School*. In 1996 the journal was transformed to an internationally peer-reviewed publication and renamed *The Australian Journal of Indigenous Education*.

In 2022 *The Australian Journal of Indigenous Education* transitioned to fully Open Access and this article is available for use under the license conditions below.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/ or send a letter to Creative Commons, PO Box 1866, Mountain View, CA 94042, USA.

people are regarded as "native informants" for non-Indigenous projects (pp. 82-85). Kuokkanen takes an optimistic view that the alternatives can be navigated: beyond exclusion and institutionalization lies the possibility of a change in the mainstream based on accepting the gift of Indigenous epistemes. It also involves an ethics of openness to the other that in the university context means learning rather than knowing a series of facts. She sees this in terms of ethical singularity or a recognition of the distinctness of the other. She writes "Ethical singularity requires not only patience but also acceptance that there will always be gaps, that the 'other' can never be fully known, that there will always be something that has not got across" (p. 118). Acceptance of this limitation to learning helps to deal with the fear of appropriation.

However, as Kuokkanen notes, there are difficulties in convincing academics in the current university environment to be open to the logic of the gift she outlines. That environment is less open in certain respects than in previous decades "because of the pressures of corporate accountability, we are in fact witnessing an opposite development: cut-throat individualism and academic anxiety for excellence are now precluding the possibility of ethical singularity as well as any commitments we might feel to engage with others in non-exploitative terms" (p. 119). This environment is an extreme expression of the very exchange logic that Kuokkanen wants to replace with the logic of the gift. This gift logic is one that involves sharing and giving back but not something of equal value to what has been given or to the same people who originally gave. Giving in this sense is a form of circulation rather than exchange (p. 145).

As Kuokkanen recognises, there is a temptation to expect very specific, concrete recommendations as to how to be open to the gift of Indigenous epistemes, that would involve policies, curricula, and reading lists. She avoids this approach as this misconceives the gift, which involves an on-going process and commitment. If lists were provided, this would obviate the need for an active concern with overcoming ignorance. That said, the book itself is an enormous resource and some suggestions are made. What Kuokkanen is calling for is not just inclusion of Indigenous "content" in university curricula but examination of and change in interpretation and analysis. The teacher has to learn from others in order to be able to teach. Universities need to examine their own practices of domination and share power by having Indigenous representatives involved in decision-making (p. 150). Academics need to reject epistemic arrogance and claims to academic disinterestedness and impartiality as well as engaging in dialogue on numerous levels (p. 154). Another reason a concrete approach cannot work, as Kuokkanen notes in her afterword (p. 164) is that each specific place has its own unique Indigenous philosophies and practices and so the process of overcoming ignorance will be specific to that place, rather than one that can be established for all.

Although Kuokkanen supports Indigenous universities and separate Indigenous programs, she does not believe that these enable the gift of Indigenous epistemes to be given. The gift of Indigenous epistemes is one that non-Indigenous academics and students should accept. In order to accept this gift, people have to "do their homework", a phrase Kuokkanen borrows from Gayatri Spivak to express both the need to learn more about Indigenous epistemes and the need to focus on the place one is working to understand the relations that characterise it (Spivak, 1990). One example is environmental philosophy and education, where Indigenous peoples' relations with the land and understanding of the land have received attention. However, Kuokkanen is critical of much environmental discourse as it does not explore the history of colonialism and elaborate the connections between the degradation of land and the impoverishment of aboriginal people (p. 124). A more promising example is the development of "indigenous humanities" which aims at the decolonisation of knowledge both through critique of Eurocentric humanities and through "reclaiming and validating indigenous epistemologies, methodologies, and research questions" (p. 143). The contrast between these two approaches gives some sense of the practical implications of Kuokkanen's work. This book is immensely readable and an important text for those interested in Indigenous education and for those who are open to the gift of Indigenous epistemes.

References

Derrida, J. (1992). *Given time: 1. Counterfeit money* (P. Kamuf, Trans). Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press.

Spivak, G. C. (1990). *The post-colonial critic: Interviews, strategies, dialogues.* London: Routledge.

THE SOUNDSCAPES OF AUSTRALIA: MUSIC, PLACE AND SPIRITUALITY

Fiona Richards (Ed.)
Ashgate, Aldershot and Burlington, 2007, vii+327pp,
ISBN 978 07546 4072 1

Reviewed by Mark Evans & Philip Hayward

Department of Contemporary Music Studies, Macquarie University, Sydney, New South Wales, 2109, Australia

The last few years have seen a number of dramatic public engagements with place and spiritualities through

the means of music. The most prominent – and most heavily mediated – instances of these have involved the mobilisation and reinvigoration of popular song text at events that accompanied the Sydney Olympics and the Millennium celebrations. Icehouse's "Great Southern Land", Neil Murray's "My Island Home" and Goanna's "Solid Rock" (recall the chorus of the latter, "standing on solid rock/standing on sacred ground" ...) are obvious examples. And this is of course only the tip of a musical iceberg, connections with place and inter-relations with Christian and traditional Indigenous spirituality abound in various forms of Australian country music (to cite another significant genre). There's also the complex area of music and new age spirituality that is a major subcultural pursuit and a significant market niche for specialist providers. In short, it's an invigorating period to be living in for those interested in the aspects identified in the title of Richards' book. But, for all its virtues, the volume under review is at pains to bypass these areas.

As Richards carefully expresses in her introduction:

> The aim of this book ... is to look at some of the ways in which composers and performers have attempted to convey a sense of the place that is Australia through musical means. It does not purport to be a comprehensive or historical account (p. 2)

While this partially offsets the significance of the catalogue of exclusions we have just identified it also raises fresh issues. Take the phrase "the place that is Australia"; what place exactly is that?

Although unstated, the "Australia" offered here and the Australians considered to express its spirituality in various ways is one that is constituted by a corpus of writers, educators, composers and performers whose sensibilities have been nurtured within the Western fine music tradition. This, inevitably, determines their worldviews and taste canons. Fine music and Indigenous music (plus one contribution on sound art) are in the frame, everything else is outside. While Indigenous musicians are an object of analysis (indeed, in some of the best-researched and argued chapters in the volume), their voices are not present as contributors.

In her introduction, Richards cites Peter Read's 2000 book *Belonging: Australians, Place and Aboriginal Ownership* as offering insights into the understandings of place and spirituality that feature throughout her anthology. As she acknowledges such insights offer a point of connection with and understanding of contemporary Australian consciousness, or at least those parts of it that may be adduced from analysing musical works that can be interpreted as invoking it. So far so good. Read's work is important in offering insights into how non-Indigenous Australians construct their senses of belonging. Richards is wise in her choice of such a referent as it allows her an entré into an area that she, as British academic with an attachment to Australia, wishes to explore.

But along with the issue of what is spirituality (discussed below); the most pertinent issue concerns the nature of the Australia the editor and contributors are conjuring. The book lays itself open to critique for representing an Australia formed of tiny populaces either clustered around inner-city ivory towers and concert halls or else dispersed in the outback (with all those inconvenient suburban sprawls and sensibilities conveniently bypassed). While Anne Boyd seizes on Read's engagement with Ross Edwards's "Dawn Mantras" on an in-flight audio channel whilst flying east-west across the continent as key connection between his book and the project of this volume (p. 12); it doesn't negate the chasm of communities implicit throughout.

We'll switch perspectives at this point. Notwithstanding all the above, how does the book work within itself? The answer, as with any anthology, is variably. The issue of spirituality is another problem. In terms of the book's subtitle, it is "spirituality" that is left at the margins of the place-based focus, having a rather shadowy presence. We are never given a clear definition of how "spirituality" is to be read within the volume. Indeed, the book tends to support Fiona Magowan's dutiful observation that the term is "often vague and poorly defined in an age when the West is searching for a new spirituality" (p. 282). Sally Macarthur shies away from spirituality in favour of the "mystical ... to refer to both the idea of being 'connected or united with God' (or a higher power for good) in a way that transcends human comprehension" (p. 51), but this is very different again to the notion of spirituality represented by devout religious practice – akin to that described by Kay Dreyfus and Bronia Kornhauser in their illuminating (but peripheral) piece on Shepparton's Lubavitch community. The discussions of Aboriginal music are also clearly on a different wavelength.

On a more positive note, leaving the reader to join the dots of connection in a volume such as this does yield some fascinating threads. To take one example, the various manifestations of feminine/female creativity that are explored (and it should be noted, most enthusiastically, that this volume is dominated by female authors) create many points of intersection throughout the volume. In her excellent overview of the history and assimilation of Christian music with traditional, ancestral "spirit" music in Arnhem Land, Magowan points out that "While there are clear restrictions upon the role of women in traditional ritual performance ... women nevertheless lead the singing in Christian worship" (p. 293). Such a reversal of roles is fascinating, and more so when considered along statements like Macarthur's: "It is a spirituality that is feminine in nature, yet grounded in earthly,

bodily, lived experience ... it is also a spirituality that references, in part, the mystical world of the indigenous culture" (p. 54).

One of the weaker chapters in the volume is the editor's own piece on Ealing film scores of the 1940s and 1950s. For one, given the large amount of contextualisation throughout the volume (extremely biographical in some chapters, including this one), it is surprising not to have Ealing studios discussed more generally for those who may not be familiar with them. Listing credits and plot synopses does not really suffice. More concerning is the lack of reference to the large, pre-existing body of work on film music. Like the topic of the piece, it is as though Richards writes about film music from afar, without participating in the (now quite historical) community it emanates from. Furthermore, the valuable work of those who have written about music within the Ealing films, would have enhanced, and indeed problematised, the work no end. The book is stronger on its coverage of Australian composers – and has a useful discussion on composer Clive Douglas and his relation to the Jindyworobak Manifesto, for instance – and will be useful for conservatorium libraries and for art music aficionados on these counts.

The volume is generously strewn with tables and pictures (including eight colour plates). While, for these reviewers at least, not all the pictures enhanced the textual material (for example, the landscape picture on p. 123), the authors and publishers are to be commended for such a detailed investment in the subject area.

In her chapter Macarthur notes that her work is "necessarily incomplete" (p. 74), in the sense that readings remain partial and open to interpretation. Many others in the volume could also make this confession. But this is a positive feature of the volume; there is much that jumps out of the chapters enticing the reader to further reflection or deeper study. Is, for example, feminine spirituality something discernible? Can one sonically depict the essence of Australian landscapes from afar? Is "lived experience" crucial to a notion of place? Would transplanted musical cultures have survived whatever the location they found themselves in?

This ultimately is a volume about place, and the musical sensibilities used by some groups to construct, re-imagine, celebrate, honour and remember place. This is an important focus. Interpreted more broadly, it allows us to begin to explore our relationship to the transcendent, to the mystic, to history, to our gender, and to our own personal inclinations. This is an important enterprise and in that this book assists it, it merits attention. A more purposeful consideration of context and scope could have made this volume essential reading on the topic, as it is, it tantalises as much as it delivers.

TERRA NULLIUS: A JOURNEY THROUGH NO ONE'S LAND

Sven Lindqvist (S. Death, Trans.)
Granta Books, London, 2007, vi+248pp, ISBN 978 1 86207 895 6

Reviewed by Dennis Foley[1] & Jillian Barnes[2]

1 University of Newcastle, New South Wales, 2300, Australia
2 University of Sydney, New South Wales, 2006, Australia

Reviewing this book has been a challenge to ensure that Lindqvist is analysed in a just manner. As this is a complex text two reviewers from differing standpoints (the Indigenous social scientist and the non-Indigenous historian of travel and tourism) have combined to ensure the reader achieves a well-rounded opinion.

Sven Lindqvist is an accomplished Swedish author with a doctorate in the history of literature from Stockholm University. May we suggest interested readers visit http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sven_Lindqvist to obtain an additional opinion of what appears to be a set writing style: a tried and proven formula of seductive, free flowing and highly provocative postcolonial travel writing which is applied ***again*** in the same smooth literary style as applied to previous publications. This book has been published in several languages, appealing to a predominantly European rather than an Australian audience. It combines a narrative of Lindqvist's alleged personal journey of 7,000 miles around the western half of the continent and then into its desert heart with local histories of place, philosophical musings and dreams, theories of race and human origins, polemical argument and autobiographical streams of consciousness to explicitly engage in the Australian history wars and locate them within a global movement of postcolonial reckoning. We say "alleged" because Lindqvist paints a very different picture to that promoted by the tourism industry, whose glossy marketing images often reinforce colonial myths produced by generations of political elites and the historians they have enfranchised. In doing so however, Lindqvist often replaces one form of stereotype with another and makes the reviewers question whether the author has really visited some locations and witnessed the complexities of contemporary outback life. See for example the negative descriptions of Coober Pedy (pp. 20-21), Fitzroy Crossing (p. 90), Tennant Creek (pp. 56-58) or Laverton (p. 145). On one hand, these do little to support the idealistic image of a noble pioneering nation founded on a history of European discovery and peaceful settlement. On the other, they simply replace the stereotypical Aboriginal drunk with the crude, alcoholic white settler: "... the whole town