



# The Australian Journal of **INDIGENOUS EDUCATION**

This article was originally published in printed form. The journal began in 1973 and was titled *The Aboriginal Child at School*. In 1996 the journal was transformed to an internationally peer-reviewed publication and renamed *The Australian Journal of Indigenous Education*.

In 2022 *The Australian Journal of Indigenous Education* transitioned to fully Open Access and this article is available for use under the license conditions below.



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/> or send a letter to Creative Commons, PO Box 1866, Mountain View, CA 94042, USA.

explanation of the welcome to Larrakia Country. Then the introduction of the book "About this book" provides further explanation for why a reader might read this book, orienting the reader to the place, the people and the cultural issues required to understand the cultural protocols referred to in the "Responsible travel" and "Travelling respectfully beyond Darwin" sections.

"Responsible travel" brings together the issues of cultural responsibility as well as personal safety. Separating them into two sections would have more successfully reinforced the importance of each – "Culturally responsible travel" including the sections on "Travelling respectfully beyond Darwin" and then "Travelling safely".

"Travelling respectfully beyond Darwin" needs more information about the accessibility of Aboriginal communities or land for tourists. A map showing the location of Aboriginal land and clearly detailing those places which are accessible, those which require permits and those which are not normally open to tourists at all would give a truer reflection of the accessibility of Aboriginal land than the current section "Respecting people's privacy" does.

Some clearer guidelines on how to "be especially sensitive during funerals and cultural ceremonies" (page x) is essential. My own experience is that unless the ceremonies are being performed for a public audience or you have an invitation, in which case you usually receive a "guide", it is very rare for visitors to be present at such ceremonies. The recognition of local ownership and the need for visitors/strangers to make known their purpose and intent underpins the warning about waiting for an invitation. This information should be provided more directly, given the history of Aboriginal people.

As I write this review the Larrakia have just lost their case for Native Title to certain sites of Darwin. Land claims over areas around Darwin have been the longest running in NT history and subject to appeal and counter-appeal. Darwin and its environs are still closely contested between Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples.

*Aboriginal Darwin*, then, is a timely reminder. It provides a recognition of ongoing ownership and rights, an introduction to the foundation and history of Darwin beyond more than a century or two suggesting possibilities for more detailed and specialist Australian histories. It also documents the willingness of the Larrakia to be part of the development of Darwin into a capital city, the capital of a twenty-first century state, not a nineteenth or twentieth century state.

I would recommend this book not just to tourists but as an introduction to Darwin for all residents. In particular, I would suggest that those who might be coming to Darwin to teach our children be provided with a copy. It provides all of us with the opportunity to walk across the bridge of reconciliation each time we travel our city.

## DISTURBANCES AND DISLOCATIONS: UNDERSTANDING TEACHING AND LEARNING EXPERIENCES IN INDIGENOUS AUSTRALIAN WOMEN'S MUSIC AND DANCE

Elizabeth Mackinlay

European University Studies Series XI Education,  
Vol. 932, Peter Lang, Bern, 2007, 296pp,  
ISBN 978-3-03910-825-1

Reviewed by Robin Ryan

22B John Street, North Fremantle, Western Australia,  
6159, Australia

Prodigious scholar and educator Elizabeth Mackinlay recently garnered an international publication based on her second doctoral dissertation. Centred in the discipline of education, this stimulating ethnographic case study documents her half-decade of work as a Senior Lecturer in the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies Unit at the University of Queensland in Brisbane. In this educational setting Mackinlay facilitated the participation, beginning in 1997, of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander women in her course ANTH2120 Women's Music and Dance in Indigenous Australia. Mackinlay is a critical thinker and theorist with a keen sense of calling and a magnanimous, humane spirit shines through all her presentations and publications.

Most notably, Yanyuwa women Dinah a-Marrangawi Norman, Jemima a-Wuwarlu Miller, Rosie a-Makurndurnamara Noble and Linda a-Wambadurnamara McDinny from the Aboriginal community at Borroloola, Northern Territory, participated in the course as guest lecturers/performers of their music/dance culture. Drawing primarily on workshops they conducted in 2000 and 2001 (preceded by a 1999 pilot study), the book explores the polyphonic nature of power relations, performance roles and pedagogical texts in the context of teaching and learning Indigenous Australian women's music and dance.

In many ways the model on which this teaching and learning is based resembles that pioneered by Mackinlay's mentor, the late ethnomusicologist Catherine Ellis, in her establishment of the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music (CASM) at the University of Adelaide in 1975 (see pp. 54-55). CASM remains the prototype for the official recognition and

appointment of Indigenous teachers in Australian educational institutions, its operations having been characterised by cultural interaction and exchange between elite thinkers in both cultures. In her book *Aboriginal music: Education for living: Cross-cultural experiences from South Australia*, Ellis (1985, p. 2) described how:

In the process of the education of the total person which occurs through the use of music, the student may learn relatively little about music (although that is not necessarily so). But [they] inevitably gain a great deal of experience in reconciling and rising above contradictions both within [themselves] and in [their] relations with others.

As time progressed, a contemporary CASM began to operate on an ethnomusicological platform that was activist- and advocacy-based to better serve Indigenous interests (see Turner, 1999, p. 145).

In *Disturbances and dislocations*, Mackinlay explores the central question of how, and for what purpose(s), do Indigenous cultural traditions and intellectual bodies of knowledge make the journey into mainstream educational settings. Scholars throughout the world agree that reclaiming Indigenous traditions and bringing these knowledge systems into the university system is imperative for postcolonial reconciliation, but – as Mackinlay notes – the challenges confronting this task are characteristically complex. Her operative solution has been to use performance as the primary pedagogical text whilst remaining open to negotiation in the search for new understanding of a number of issues that all exist within one another.

Mackinlay's book is at once personal and political (p. 15), her agenda unashamedly anti-colonial, critical and transformative. A major theme is the primacy of allowing Indigenous women's voices to speak, sing and dance as a means to disrupt and challenge Aboriginalist notions and representations of Indigenous women's performance. In the words of the book's back cover, "the performance classroom is examined as a potential site for disturbing and dislocating dominant modes of representation of Indigenous women's performance through the construction, mediation and negotiation of Indigenous knowledge from and between both non-Indigenous and Indigenous voices".

Paradoxically, the decolonising objective of challenging Aboriginalist representations of Indigenous people silencing or excluding Indigenous voices is often articulated in the text by derivative deference to the work of non-Aboriginal researchers (e.g. Dunbar-Hall, Neuenfeldt, Newsome, Turner and York on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander music education, and Magowan and Tamisari on Aboriginal dance). A debate that Mackinlay draws on more convincingly to advance her objective concerns the article by Bell

co-authored with Warlpiri elder Topsy Napurrula Nelson (1989) that was challenged by Huggins et al. (1991). Moreton-Robinson's views on Indigenous representation are also well-aired.

The author is widely respected for her ethnographic knowledge of Yanyuwa repertoire (based on her PhD, 1998); hence her approach to staging the workshops was in no way superficial considering that as the wife of a Yanyuwa man she stands in a song partner relationship with some of the women. As she negotiates the strategic situation in which she finds herself as a researcher, teacher, performer and local Yanyuwa community member, Mackinlay's field becomes her classroom, her classroom the field. With awareness of the responsibility that accompanies privilege, she sets in frame dialogue over monologue to teach with and for – rather than about and against – Indigenous women in her locale.

But how does she reconcile familiarity with the agency of scholarly distance? The frustrations of personal positionality with respect to power, standpoint and representation take up "residency in her heart and mind" (p. 72) as Mackinlay problematises – and grapples with – the sometimes uneasy "doubleness" of her own multisubjective role in the task. It is admirable that she can bare her soul so honestly and openly, for example:

It is not possible to deny the reality of these "multiplities", they exist, I live and breathe them. I must acknowledge them to simultaneously be whom I am, to allow the Others to be who they are, and to allow us to sustain a meaningful dialogue with each other (p. 267).

The reader is left with an impression, from the many reiterations of this problem (e.g., pp. 23, 28-30, 35, 51, 64-65, 68-73, 78, 80-83, 151-153, 159-160, 265-267), that the balance of her roles swing in different directions at different moments.

The book comprises an introduction followed by eight unnumbered sections. It is confusing that the sections are designated "chapters" in the introductory text, but not in the index or at the beginning of each new section. Each illuminates a particular facet of the topic, although fluid interaction operates across the perspectives. The book's major strength is continuity in the reasoning and logic that accompanies its exigencies. An enjoyable visual reading of black and white photographs of workshops, student and Indigenous performers complements the narrative.

An index and a glossary for non-connoisseurs would have improved an otherwise handsome publication. A small number of textual errors escaped the proofreaders. It is a pity that the editor did not give the work perfect due in this regard, but this and other minor considerations do not alter the crucial contribution that the book makes to the field of education generally.



Apart from education, academic disciplines represented in the book include Aboriginal studies, ethnomusicology, gender studies, performance studies, political history, social anthropology and social science. An innate disadvantage of cross-disciplinary study is over-reliance on critical jargon and this was obviously a factor that the author could not avoid. Ultimately the reader needs more than a basic familiarity with the topic as it is not easy fare to engage with a text so intensely fraught with literary exegesis, cultural/political analysis, self-reflexion and data documentation. The writing style itself is lucid but occasionally repetitive of previous text (e.g., p. 62 largely repeats p. 59).

The book sustains an in-depth literature review across several chapters since it is grounded on doctoral research. Mackinlay exploits the readings to squeeze the last drop of theory out of her local task. She introduces a raft of concepts including *dialogue*, *heteroglossia* (the idea of the subject as a site for conflicting discourse and competing voices), *centripetal* (language of the status quo) versus *centrifugal* (language of the subversive) *forces*, and *utterance*. Fortunately Mackinlay has demonstrated an engaging knack for linking these theories to lived experiences.

Of all the theories broached in the book, Bakhtin's (1981) theories of dialogue and voice (pp. 84-87) are arguably the most relevant to the study as they celebrate difference by interrogating and shifting the centre from the margins. Dialogism proves a useful tool for understanding how the dialogue between Western and Indigenous women's modes of knowledge production takes place. Giroux's liberatory border pedagogy for making marginalised voices visible (p. 89) also informs the stance taken.

In her discourse on performing bodies (Chapter 7), Mackinlay reviews theories by Foucault, Grosz, Bourdieu and others before exploring white and black feminist readings of body politics to consider the way that race, racism and oppression are inscribed and performed through the body. Following this, she describes how "black bodies are juxtaposed against white and white bodies collide with black" (p. 232) in her classroom, providing moments for the non-Indigenous present to confront and negotiate the race privilege and power inscribed on their white bodies:

It allows for white bodies to actively resist hegemonic constructions of Indigenous Australian women's performance traditions via interaction and engagement with black bodies and a performed approach to pedagogy (p. 232).

In this section, the passionate connection that Mackinlay professes (on page 16) to the thoughts of bell hooks presented in *Teaching to transgress: Education as the practice of freedom* (1994) is evident.

A choice combination of ethnographic, case study and narrative methodological approaches undergird the book. Mackinlay supplements the performative core of the course with appropriate ethnographic readings, but pedagogical expectations of the ANTH2120 student remain focused on experience, activism and personal growth. She uses the social science research tools of *free-writes* (a projective survey in which a narrative is elicited from students in response to specific questions); and *focus group interviews* to ascertain how students summarise, debrief and reflect upon their experiences in the classroom. She also employs student survey (demographic data) and University of Queensland teaching evaluation comments.

The index of student response to the pedagogical process discloses the students' openness to difference and dialogue and a willingness to negotiate their own subject positions in relation to the Yanyuwa women. The student voice is quite predominant in the book, but balanced by the incorporation into Chapter 6 of interviews with four Yanyuwa women. Yet Mackinlay's own voice remains firmly at the core of the reflection, even amidst sustained references to secondary sources.

The author filmed aspects of the embodied approach to teaching and learning in the classroom context, then selected 19 minutes of clips for a CD included in the book's inside cover. The clips are explained in the text, and, if viewed at this point, will greatly enliven it. One is left with the impression that the students were vitally engaged by the classes. In Clips 6 to 11, for example, their performance of contemporary dances taught by Yanyuwa/Wardaman woman Samantha Chalmers reaches a high standard of rhythmical precision and expression which attests to a high level of concentration and enjoyment.

Interestingly, Clips 4 and 11 feature the male students dancing, but the most confronting aspect of the clips is the unusual sight of Mackinlay and her white female students dancing in bras. Student Rachel (p. 224) comments that the white ochre does not look nearly as striking on their white skins as it does on the Yanyuwa women. Such are the quirks characteristic to the involvement of many voices in a "dialogue across difference".

The methodology is meticulous, but I have reservations as to whether the comparative sampling of statistical data from the years 2000 and 2001 supplies a large enough sample from which to draw lasting conclusions. It is a very useful beginning, however, and it would be interesting to see how, in future follow-up data, the relationships of the observer to the observed might change across time according to the variables.

The educational ramifications of the book are considerable. Firstly, the author's proactive stance in facilitating Yanyuwa identity projects relevance to the study of research methods that rely on working



in and with Aboriginal communities. Secondly, it raises the issue of appropriate methods of access to alternative knowledges in mainstream society. Thirdly, it contributes distinctively to Australian political history by recognising the centrality of expressive culture to the production of power and resistance. Education itself is political power and where there is power there is an opportunity for resistance (pp. 264-265). Participatory experiential learning provides a powerful pedagogical moment for change and transformation. In the light of the observation that "music can transcend musicality and enter the realm of the extra-musical as the nexus of performance, politics and pedagogy" (Neuenfeldt 1998, p. 17), Mackinlay facilitates the use of pedagogical space where students can name and interrogate their racist ideologies. She maintains that transformation can only occur when non-Indigenous people also take some responsibility for knowing, acting against and speaking against racism (p. 264).

Finally, the book's exhaustive analyses project pedagogical approaches as an important agenda in Indigenous Australian studies. These include the concept of becoming a "dancing scholar" as a vehicle for making meaning and knowledge (p. 20). Eschewing a benign concept of cultural difference that reinforces the exotic (p. 253), Mackinlay successfully promotes in her class a passion for learning and, beyond that, consideration of how this passion might become transformed into social awareness and personal and political engagement (p. 275). Her student responses to performance in pedagogy may be seen to affirm the pedagogical opportunity that the process provided.

The author has honourably answered Keil's (1998) call for ethnomusicologists to become better performance theorists, to "lively up" ourselves, to restore our groove capacity and to reintegrate our "musicking" with theory and practice (paraphrased by Mackinlay, pp. 16-17). It was no simple task to self-critique an educational course which she had personally devised, developed and administered. But the resourceful Mackinlay accepted the challenge, realising that, as a non-Indigenous woman moving largely in Indigenous spheres of interaction, she was in an ideal strategic position to promote inclusionary politics in education. If anything, the book's title *Disturbances and dislocations* posits a negative-sounding spin on a study which is profoundly reconciliatory in spirit.

Mackinlay textualised her findings using a broad range of methods and models to produce a comprehensive seminal text. This advocates and advances the concept of giving and receiving between Indigenous and non-Indigenous voices in a move towards empowerment and the generation of something "beyond themselves" (p. 87). Mackinlay is currently at the vanguard of emancipatory education in Australia and I would highly recommend that her

work forms the basis of a television documentary. It is surely an indictment on our society that courses incorporating Indigenous performance traditions have not become commonplace in mainstream Australian educational curricula based on CASM's working model for the universality of music. In Mackinlay's own words:

The creation of new university curricula and research methodologies that are grounded in and can accommodate the holism of these performance traditions, without comprising their fundamental integrity is fundamental to challenging the strong and oppressive hold of colonialism (p. 14).

## ■ References

- Bakhtin, M. (1981). *The dialogic imagination: Four essays* (C. Emerson & M. Holquist, Trans.). Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Bell, D. & Nelson, T. N. (1989). Speaking about rape is everyone's business. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 12(4), 403-416.
- Ellis, C. J. (1985). *Aboriginal music: Education for living: Cross-cultural experiences from South Australia*. St Lucia, QLD: University of Queensland Press.
- hooks, b. (1994). *Teaching to transgress: Education as the practice of freedom*. New York: Routledge.
- Huggins, J., Willmot, J., Tarrago, I., Willets, K., Bond, L., Holt, L., Bourke, E., Bin Salik, M., Fowell, P., Schmider, J., Craigie, V., & McBride-Levi, L. (1991). Letter to the editor. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 14(5), 506-507.
- Keil, C. (1998). Call and response: Applied sociomusicology and performance studies. *Ethnomusicology*, 42(2), 303-311.
- Mackinlay, E. (1998). *For our mother's song we sing: Yanyuwa women performers and composers of a-nguyulnguyul*. Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Adelaide, Adelaide.
- Neuenfeldt, K. (1998). Aboriginal didgeridui in Australian education: Culture workers and border crossers. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 19(1), 5-19.
- Turner, A. (1999). Towards Indigenous discourses in musicology: Reflections from a negotiated space at the margins of the academy. In G. Bloustein (Ed.), *Musical visions: Selected conference proceedings from 6th national Australian/New Zealand IASPM and inaugural Arnhem Land performance conference* (pp. 142-146). Adelaide: Wakefield Press.